

**Day Ten**  
**Fredericton**  
December 4, 2003

**Peter Martin**, *presenter*, asked 'Are we going to witness the massive destruction of the forest resource, as we did the northern cod?'

Our options: the Acadian mixed forest is a fabulously rich and beautiful resource, with it comes the potential for economic diversity and jobs. We should use our noggins to create more jobs with less fibre use - that should be the subject of discussions - we need a "Made in NB" report. People know about the mismanagement of Crown Lands, the AAC has been routinely ignored, over harvesting has been going on - who is minding the mint here, Mr. Martin asked. He recommended that we start a new process by starting public consultation on forest management, use the Boreal Forest Conservation Framework resource, and generate economic activity by leaving the trees.

**Frank Carroll**, *Mayor of McAdam*, **Don Doherty** and **John Kilbride**, *representing the Southwestern NB Stakeholders Committee*, made a presentation on Community Based Forestry and the model they have developed and want to implement. Mr. Carroll stated that to continue the status quo and to implement the Jaakko-Poyry report was unacceptable. It is time to change and community forestry is an alternative to the present industrial model. In southwest NB, all stakeholders: municipalities, business, tourism and recreation have supported this initiative, locally funded, which will promote community-based values, enhance timber growth and overall support a working forest, maintain fish and wildlife and greatly enhance return on investment. So, overhaul the Crown Lands and Forest Act, it is time to implement the St. Croix Management Plan:

*Implementation would be as follows:*

- 10 member Board of Directors comprised of logging contractors, watershed protection associations, recreation and tourism, local business and educational representation.

*Operation plan:*

- Core team of qualified professionals and technicians
- Charged with developing multi-value forest management plan
- Responsible to meet certification
- Balance needs of all stakeholders

*Benefits of community forestry:*

- Full and fair market stumpage value on monthly basis
- Supports private woodlot owners and fair market value for them
- Provides industry with secure wood supply
- Financial projections made were conservative, based on fair market value and AAC.

Mr. Carroll read extracts of the Speech from the Throne of 2000, citing "the government believes in the empowerment of communities, believes NBers should have a more direct say."



Mayor Frank Carroll and Don Doherty

**Fred Nott**, *President of Wood Products Group* and **Graham Savage**, *Forest Economist* described their non-profit group, established in 1992 to represent the 285 value-added wood products businesses of NB, whose sales yearly are roughly 1 billion dollars. Mr. Nott stated that existing policies focus almost exclusively on pulp and paper industry and the J-P report would like that to continue, however, the value-added industry would like to be a part of the mix. He then characterized the softwood and the hardwood industries: the first being big industry, few companies, more vulnerable to economic downturn, older companies, fewer companies over years, relatively homogenous, driven by volume - the hardwood industry comprised of many small companies, 7000 employees, diversified, younger companies, 60 % formed since 1985, growing in number, complex, many machines, less wood, more tools per inch of wood used.

*DNR policies*, Mr Savage stated, should be in line with province's needs, there is no policy covering value-added industry - to obtain wood, to promote.  
Recommendation: to have a virtual licenses to allocate wood and redirect it to value-added industry.

**Ken Thomas**, *self-employed professional forester from Stanley, NB* has concerns with:

- 1) overall genetic diversity reduction, according to the recommendations of the J-P report
- 2) cost: planting and tending of trees, aggressive herbicide treatment are all costly and are competing with natural regeneration!
- 3) already experiencing a lack of trained employees for silviculture whose pay and working conditions are poor therefore creating great turnover.

*Mr. Thomas recommends:*

- a) Initiatives which include private and public lands;
- b) Plan to maximize timber on Crown Lands and private lands;
- c) Getting more \$ out of every tree harvested should be primary objective;
- d) Good monitoring of our forest, no reductions at DNR;
- e) Make a level playing field between Crown and private wood
- f) More stands should be partially harvested;
- g) Long term plan to increase supply, with wood supply objective balanced with social and environmental ones.

**Lee MacPherson**, *Wallace Equipment*, reiterated that the status quo be maintained and the J-P report be implemented.

**Stewart MacPherson**, *President, NB Power* and **Mr. Marshall**, stated that there was a vital interdependence between NB Power and the forest industry. Pulp and

paper mills are the largest users of electricity in NB, that because there is some co-generation by industry this increases mills' efficiency and reduces NB Power's costs, that they do get a better rate sometimes.

**Kathy Tosh**, *Master of Science in Forestry, of the NB Tree Improvement Council*, represented by UNB, U de Moncton, industry and DNR, is a research aspect of DNR, whose mandate is to grow bigger and better trees, using genetic material, not genetically-modified, she stressed. Thus far, in 20 years, in their research, they have roughly 400,000 trees whose volume has increased by 10%, using traditional breeding methods.

**Mitch Lansky**, *author of Low Impact Forestry - Forestry as if it Mattered, from northern Maine*, has been writing about wood industry for 30 years. He stated that the J-P report was sloppy research, having no references, which raised questions about its credibility. The report's suggestion that there is overlap in management and that Dept. of Natural Resources could reduce its personnel and have a 3rd party audit was itself questionable - that 3rd parties often have a quick look, a couple of times a year - that if fact, daily adequate monitoring was necessary. In Maine, industry has broken regulations but still remained certified! The fact that silviculture is paid for by government is or could be a problem in international trading as this is a subsidy, as well as internally, as unfair competition to the private sector. The J-P further confuses increased harvesting with more jobs, where in fact, recent history shows that the opposite has happened in Maine and in NB. Recently in Maine, industry has requested tax cuts because they cannot compete in global markets. Mr. Lansky suggested a) that it was better to invest in value-added for the long term, and, b) that Crown lands cannot sustain a perpetual increase of 15 yearly. He asked "what is preferable, more boreal forests, with intensive use of pesticides and a rotation of 50 years or a long term multi-use investment and jobs in the value added sector?" He finished by saying "unless NB changes direction, it will end up where it is headed!"

[Supporting [Document 1](#)] [Doc 2: [The Triad: Is it really win-win?](#)]



Mitch Lansky from Maine chatting with the Commissionaire at the Legislature

**Bob McLaughlin** represented the Concerned Hunters Committee of NB. He explained that he was speaking for big game hunters of moose, deer and bear, though he could not claim to be the only voice. In rereading the J-P report, he did finally come across a reference to wildlife on p.31 'changes in the forest have favoured some species and have been detrimental to others'. In fact, Mr. McLaughlin stated, deer populations are below historic levels in many areas of the province. His committee views DNR plan as mismanagement - when his committee asked DNR why deer numbers are down, they didn't know. Hunters believe that numbers are down due to clearcuts and chemical plantations. It has been suggested that land

conservation could be managed by trading private areas for public lands. Mr. McLaughlin suggested that trading off alder swamps, gravel pits and bogan holes for big game habitats was not acceptable!

*The Hunters' Committee recommendations are:*

- 1) Conduct a complete study to see the effects on wildlife with the recommendations of the J-P report
- 2) End herbicide use
- 3) Access roads should be closed and limit road incursion.
- 4) conduct a study to investigate the effect of forestry disruptions to traditional deer migration patterns
- 5) conduct a study to determine if deer can actually live year round in plantations as they exist today

Mr. McLaughlin asked the committee members to step back, look at the forest without dollars, to see a kid deer suckling its mother or a buck hooking a sapling to mark its territory or a majestic bull moose in all its splendor with steam rising from his form on an early fall morning or a mother bear herding her cubs from the den for the first time. Consider the consequences of destroying in one generation what Mother Nature has taken a millennium to give to us.

**John Lockerbie**, *Regional Director for Maritime Canada, the Ruffed Grouse Society*, explained the society is an international organization of conservationists dedicated to improving the environment for ruffed grouse, American woodcock, deer and many other species of both game and non-game forest wildlife. The Society supports scientific research and education projects.

He stated that it takes a great range of ages and species to maintain wildlife habitat for all species. In NB, approximately 43% of lands are already under 25 years old - future thinning and reduction of species will have a devastating affect on the carrying capacity for all wildlife. Sweeping changes recommended in the Jaakko-Poyry report require qualitative analysis to insure maintenance of wildlife. Mr. Lockerbie clearly asserted that Crown lands could only be managed by DNR and must remain so! Only 3% of NB is truly protected, the rest is available for limited harvesting, including deer yards.

The Society disagrees with the J-P report's assertion that doubling the wood supply is an essential objective - in effect, if the recommendations were implemented, over 60% of the carrying capacity for wildlife in this province would disappear. The government of NB is the trustee, not the owner, of our Crown lands and they are charged with managing the resources without diminishing their intrinsic value. In closing, Mr. Lockerbie noted that he was astonished to receive several phone calls from people professing to be in the forest industry, suggesting that the Ruffed Grouse Society stay out of the J-P debate - that by wading into the debate, funding to the Society might be jeopardized.

**Robert Young**, *retired forester, farmer and woodlot owner* began his presentation by saying that, like the farmer's milk cow, one does not kill the cow to get the milk! His second lesson learned was not waste what you have, not to leave the best in the swamp. A third lesson, he pointed out, was that insects destroy forests because of BAD management. He recalled a saying by a mentor: Bad woodsmen are those who don't cut and those who clearcut. Mr. Young's career with DNR led him to state that with all the studies which DNR had done, and Speeches from the Throne which were made, recommendations and intentions were not implemented - where we are now

is a result of taxation and policies established by government.  
"Give the forest back to the people of NB" he demanded.

**Dale Thibodeau** of *Sunbury Thibodeau, Trucking Co.* gave an overview of the business, describing payroll, taxes paid, number of employees, community involvement of employees. His trucking company does a great volume of its business with the forestry industry.

**Cleveland Allaby**, *represented the Loggers Association of NB*, who do harvesting, planting, thinning operations, working primarily, but not only, in the Chipman and Doaktown area, and are mostly employed by JD Irving. Mr. Allaby gave a brief overview of the Loggers Assoc. Licensees downloaded costs of equipment, insurance and operating costs etc on loggers, saying that they would their own contractors. Problems began when beyond the equipment, the service vehicles, the mechanics, the operators, the clerks and replacement equipment ...all became very expensive, requiring loans, borrowed against their own homes and retirements. Presently, what contractors are assigned is what they get, some areas being harder to work in and less productive than others. The Loggers Assoc has a concern that JDI will unfairly treat its members through the unbalanced application of a new 'productivity policy' by assigning less dense or poor quality cutting sites to contractors then applying poor productivity penalties. They are all concerned that although they are self employed independent contractors, JDI intends to limit the incomes of the contractors so that they make a wage and they will be treated as employees - that JDI informs contractors that changes are necessary in a global economy. These actions could result in the squeezing out of contractors, suggested Mr. Allaby, describing such behavior with words such as monopolistic and opportunistic, all behaviour created by the Crown Lands and Forest Act - leaving contractors extremely vulnerable rather than the promise of being independent business people. Mr. Allaby recommended, on behalf of the Loggers Assoc., that a Crown Lands Compensation Board be established which would set remuneration rates industry wide and province wide.

**Steven Hoyt**, *Maritime College of Forest Technology, formerly the Maritime Forest Ranger School* stated that NBers don't realize that NB is a net importer of wood and that this will decline as demands are made on that imported wood. He suggested that though the industry focus is on spruce, fir and jack pine that he encouraged research to use underutilized species, as well as on natural regeneration. He said that all goals must be addressed in the wood supply analysis, that the future wood supply has implications for future generations, that the capital must stay, that clear cutting was an acceptable practice only in same age stands, not on mixed-age stands, that we must have a reassessment of forestry practices. He mentioned that one good thing about the J-P report is the outburst of response from the public. He also recommended that government accelerate talks with First Nations to resolve access to Crown Lands.